FUTURE
COP26 is approaching, but the current situation of the climate crisis demonstrates that governments and corporations are unable to solve the biggest challenge of our time because they will always choose economic growth over life.

What if alternatives to the climate crisis already exist? Indigenous Peoples make up 6% of the population and are stewards of 80% of the remaining biodiversity and ecosystems that keep our planet alive. They are the least responsible for carbon emissions but are most affected by the effects of global warming.

15.10.21

In this briefing, Culture Hack Labs will be tracking an emerging narrative space that is drawing attention to the relationship between Indigenous peoples and climate collapse. We will share what narratives can be amplified in defense of cultural and ecological life in times of climate crisis, pandemics and war.
THE FUTURE IS A TERRITORY WE MUST DEFEND

"Territory is more than just the environment, territory is our whole lives. Our body is the territory and the territory is our body. We should be thinking beyond politics, and think about how we can re-enchant the world again. Awaken our senses. The challenge is to reforest our hearts."

-Célia Xakriabá

CHL Content Labs

This is the first in a series of Content Labs that CHL will be hosting. We will be tracking an emerging narrative space that is drawing attention to the relationship between Indigenous peoples and climate collapse. At this threshold moment and in preparation for the upcoming COP26, we feel this is an important narrative space for us to support and bring to the fore.

Indigenous Peoples are 6.2% of the world’s population but in their territories almost 80% of the planet’s remaining biodiversity. In the heart of those diverse ways of knowing and being, beats resilience: for more than 500 years, indigenous nations around the world have dealt with systems of oppression that threaten bodies, territories and cultures. This project focuses on co-creating replicable and scalable narratives, tools and practices with indigenous peoples, as an amplifier of movements in defense of cultural and ecological diversity in times of climate crisis, pandemics and war (see references below).

We have set up a “data observatory” that is looking at a new wave of messages, frames and stories in this narrative space. In this series we will share our findings and strategic directions for narrative change, harnessed from our data analytics platform and syntopic reframing framework.
Further Context

The climate emergency is not a distant, future event. This year alone, around the globe, we have already experienced a pandemic, droughts, fires, water crisis, floods, hurricanes, famines and loss of biodiversity at alarming rates. Every year, the number of human and more-than-human life that is displaced as a result of these climate catastrophes increases. This is not a drill, this is an emergency.

In August 2021, the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (the IPCC), issued a blood-chilling warning: if we do not change the current rates of carbon emission by 2030, the damage would be irreversible and in 2050, human life on the planet could be existentially threatened. It is also important to remember that we will not equally bear the brunt of the climate crisis. Studies show that the majority of the highest carbon emissions per capita come from the richest countries. As of 2015, the Global North was responsible for 92% of the excess emissions, while most countries in the Global South were within their boundary fair shares. But the consequences of climate change are more severe in the regions that have not contributed substantially to the crisis. The Central American region, for instance, will be one of the most vulnerable and impacted regions by the climate crisis. According to the World Health Organization, every year, 150 000 people die of diseases, starvation or other health reasons tied to climate change. This number is expected to double by 2030. Again, these deaths mostly occur in developing countries.

The climate emergency is not a distant, future event.
The climate catastrophe that today threatens the entire planet is the symptom of a disease that arrived to our territories more than 500 years ago.

-Futuros Indígenas

Never has the future felt so present. Our future is unraveling now. It is not an abstract notion anymore. Our future is a territory we must defend. It exists in the watersheds, the oceans, the mountain chains, the forests, the various ecosystems that exist on our planet. It is through these territories that life on earth has a chance to prevail, should we take the right measures to protect it.

In the 2015 Paris Agreement, UN Member States set goals to reduce carbon emissions. In general, the international community’s objective has been to regulate the current unsustainable growth model and progressively transition to a green growth model. However it remains clear that such a model will not provide us with the answers we collectively need.

Studies have shown that it is not possible to maintain an infinite economic growth model on a finite planet. In addition to being hard to implement (because most of the proposed solutions rely on the goodwill of nation states), curbing carbon emissions and promoting a green economy do not challenge the growth model, and will therefore not be sufficient to prevent the imminent extinction of life on earth. We need bolder, radical solutions.
Indigenous Futures

Indigenous peoples across the world have long denounced the political and economic systems in place that are leading mankind to its own extinction. In fact, they have resisted these very systems for decades since colonization dispossessed them from their own land, destroyed their ecosystems and annihilated their culture. Despite the devastating effects of colonization, 80% of today’s biodiversity on Earth remains in indigenous territories which represents 22% of the territory on Earth. We must learn from Indigenous resistances. They hold the knowledge that can teach the rest of us how to protect life on our planet. Indigenous land defenders are living alternatives to the climate emergency.

“Indigenous land defenders are living alternatives to the climate emergency.”

Through this, we recognize that Indigenous cultures and peoples are not homogenous and that it is this very ‘deep diversity’ of cultural perspectives that make them the ‘living alternatives to climate collapse.’ They are as hyper-diverse in ways of knowing and being, as diverse as the ecosystems and biomes they steward.
CALL TO ACTION

To journalists, artists, media hackers, content creators, and funders we need your support.

• We are asking journalists and content creators to help create more awareness around the role of Indigenous stewardship of land as a critical solution to the climate emergency.
• We are asking climate activists to incorporate Indigenous worldviews and to be in dialogue with Indigenous communities, leaders and elders so their perspectives are incorporated into the climate justice demands.
• We are asking funders to support Indigenous led initiatives and land defenders directly, especially in key biodiversity hot spots such as the Amazon, Mesoamerica, the Congo, etc.

CHL can make direct introductions and recommendations to journalists, activists, funders and others who stand in solidarity with Indigenous peoples.
CHL is a not-for-profit consultancy that supports organizations, social movements and activists to create cultural interventions for systems change.

The time is now to shift from a growth-centered culture to a life-centered culture. With the use of our narrative-specific technology platform we are listening, analysing and reframing dominant narratives in culture for systems change. By sharing these findings, our aim is to support and unite activists, journalists, social movements, artists and content creators with a shared narrative to usher in this transition.
A. The Role of Indigenous Peoples in Biodiversity

Cura da Terra 2021 Documentary Series by FGER for #BerthaChallenge
Vertebrate biodiversity on indigenous-managed lands in Australia, Brazil and Canada equals that in protected areas (July 2019), Richard Schuster et al
A spatial overview of the global importance of Indigenous lands for conservation (July 2018), Stephen G. Garnett et al
Supporting resurgent Indigenous-led governance: A nascent mechanism for just and effective conservation (December 2019), Kyle A. Artelleab et al
Co-occurrence of linguistic and biological diversity in biodiversity hotspots and high biodiversity wilderness areas (May 2012), L. J. Gorenflo et al
Traditional Wisdom: Protecting Relationships with Wilderness as a Cultural Landscape (2011), Alan Watson et al
The Biocultural Diversity of a Living Indigenous Sacred Landscape in the Gamo Highlands of Ethiopia (December 2007), Desalegn Desissa et al
Indigenous lands, protected areas, and slowing climate change (March 2010), Taylor H. Ricketts et al
Potential Spatial Overlap of Heritage Sites and Protected Areas in a Boreal Region of Northern Canada (2007), Shawn J. Leroux et al
The exceptional value of intact forest ecosystems (2018), James E. M. Watson et al
How big forests solve global problems (New York Times, April 19, 2018), Thomas Lovejoy and John Reid
Indigenous Peoples and Biodiversity (1999), Victor Toledo
The Role of Indigenous Peoples in Biodiversity Conservation (World Bank, 2008, see page 5), by Claudia Sobrevilla
The Wealth of the Poor: Managing Ecosystems to Fight Poverty (World Resources Institute, 2005, see pages 83-87)

B. The Role of the Global North in Climate Breakdown

Quantifying national responsibility for climate breakdown: an equality-based attribution approach for carbon dioxide emissions in excess of the planetary boundary (September, 2020), Jason Hickel

C. The Myth of Green Growth

Why Growth Can’t Be Green (September, 2018), Jason Hickel
From “Green Growth” to Post-Growth (April, 2018), Alnoor Ladha
Growth or Life (September, 2018) The Rules Foundation

Original Photos by: APIB, Midia Ninja, Futuros Indígenas, Stop Line 3.
This document is Creative Commons CC-BY-NC 4.0 by Culture Hack Labs 2021
THE FUTURE IS A TERRITORY WE MUST DEFEND

Culture Hack Labs
Data Analysis & Narrative Report
Oct 2021 v.1.1
Introduction

In the summer of 2021, Culture Hack Labs set up a data observatory using its in-house analytics tools and methodology. The ongoing goal of the data observatory is to map the emerging “Climate Crisis” Narrative Space -- we are interested in the most important communities and recurrent frames, themes and narratives within this space. Seeing the narrative space from this perspective allows us to identify the key strategic “narrative levers” for activists, journalists and movements. This report is an overview of the initial findings from our data observatory, providing both a deeper understanding of this narrative space and communication strategies for the upcoming Cop26.

We have been particularly motivated by the emergence of a coalition of Indigenous activists, who seek to reframe the climate crisis within a deeper structural and historical perspective; and towards a new future. They have one message for us: “Indigenous land defenders are living alternatives to the climate crisis.” We have centered their voices in this report, because we believe that this frame is the most important narrative vehicle for both system and cultural change within the narrative space. Indeed, we believe that the transition we are currently embedded within will require both system change and cultural change, that is a transformation of both ‘knowing’ and ‘being’. While there are many voices within the current narrative space, few are able to encapsulate or represent this transformative culture so well.

Our goal in this report then, is to assess the narrative space according to these two axes of ‘knowing’ and ‘being’ (more about this in the listening model section), and then finally propose key frames that can be used in unity and solidarity by the climate action communities around the world.

In the table below you will find a summary of our methodology as they pertain to different parts of this report.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase</th>
<th>Project Phase</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ASK</td>
<td>Articulate a point of view as an initial inquiry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>into the research process.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>LISTEN</td>
<td>Taking this PoV we develop a listening model</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>that collects relevant data.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UNDERSTAND</td>
<td>Mapping and developing insights relevant to the</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>PoV.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RECODE</td>
<td>Proposing new frames that will be coded into</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>media and content, or within a community of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>narrative catalysts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERVENE</td>
<td>Intervening to shift the underlying logics within</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>catalytic communities within the narrative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>space.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Introduction 1

Ask: Developing a Point of View 3

The Context 3

Indigenous Futures: Indigenous land defenders are living alternatives to the climate emergency 4

Our Point of View 4

Listen: Collecting and Coding Data 6

Understand: Mapping Communities and Identifying Frames 8

Communities in the Narrative Space 8

Recurrent Frames in the Narrative Space 11

Summary of Insights 14

Key Tactical Insights 16

We see a series of imperatives: 16

Tactical Summary: where to focus energy and how 17

Recode: Frames, Mediums & Messages 19

Frame 1. Indigenous Land Defenders are Living Alternatives to Climate Collapse 19

Frame 2. The Climate Emergency is a Consequence 20

Frame 3. The Climate Crisis is a product of the machine of extermination 20

Existing Projects 21

Appendices 22
Ask: Developing a Point of View

In the ‘Ask’ phase of our research methodology, we inquire into the context that is driving our current narrative research project. To situate us, we have articulated the context, the importance of Indigenous voices and finally our Point of View (PoV).

The Context

The climate emergency is not a distant, future event. This year alone, around the globe, we have already experienced a pandemic, droughts, fires, water crisis, floods, hurricanes, famines and loss of biodiversity at alarming rates. Every year, the number of human and more-than-human life that is displaced as a result of these climate catastrophes increases. This is not a drill, this is an emergency. Never has the future felt so present. It is not an abstract notion anymore.

In August 2021, the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (the IPCC), issued an imminent warning: if we do not change the current rates of carbon emission by 2030, the damage would be irreversible and in 2050, human life on the planet could be existentially threatened. It is also important to remember that we will not equally bear the brunt of the climate crisis. Studies show that the majority of the highest carbon emissions per capita come from the richest countries. As of 2015, the Global North was responsible for 92% of the excess emissions, while most countries in the Global South were within their boundary fair shares. But the consequences of climate change are more severe in the regions that have not contributed substantially to the crisis. The Central American region, for instance, will be one of the most vulnerable and impacted regions by the climate crisis. According to the World Health Organization, every year, 150 000 people die of diseases, starvation or other health reasons tied to climate change. This number is expected to double by 2030. Again, these deaths mostly occur in developing countries.
In the 2015 Paris Agreement, UN Member States set goals to reduce carbon emissions. In general, the international community’s objective has been to regulate the current unsustainable growth model and progressively transition to a green growth model. However it remains clear that such a model will not provide us with the answers we collectively need.

Studies have shown that it is not possible to maintain an infinite economic growth model on a finite planet. In addition to being hard to implement (because most of the proposed solutions rely on the goodwill of nation states), curbing carbon emissions and promoting a green economy do not challenge the growth model, and will therefore not be sufficient to prevent the imminent extinction of life on earth. We need bolder, radical solutions.

**Indigenous Futures:** Indigenous land defenders are living alternatives to the climate emergency

Indigenous peoples across the world have long denounced the political and economic systems in place that are leading mankind to its own extinction. In fact, they have resisted these very systems for decades since colonization dispossessed them from their own land, destroyed their ecosystems and annihilated their culture. Despite the devastating effects of colonization, 80% of today’s biodiversity on Earth remains in Indigenous territories which represents 22% of the territory on Earth. We must learn from Indigenous resistances. They hold the knowledge that can teach the rest of us how to protect life on our planet. **Indigenous land defenders are living alternatives to the climate emergency.** [Reference: #FuturosIndígenas]

Our future lies in the territories defended by Indigenous land defenders. In fact, our future exists in the watersheds, the oceans, the mountain chains, the forests, the various ecosystems that exist on our planet. It is through these territories that life on earth has a chance to prevail, should we take the right measures to protect it.

It is also important to recognize that Indigenous cultures and peoples are not homogenous and that it is this very ‘deep diversity’ of cultural perspectives that make them the living alternatives to old worn out narratives of Individualism, Neoliberalism and Progress. They are as hyper-diverse in ways of knowing and being, as diverse as the ecosystems and biomes they steward.

**Our Point of View**

At Culture Hack Labs, we believe that all power rests on the ability to harness and control language; and humans make sense of their world through stories. Narratives explain how power has come to rest in the hands of the few, rather than the many. They reveal how our struggles - from land to labour, biodiversity and even our very bodies - are part of the same
global system, one that prioritises the production of capital - in other words, economic growth - over everything else, and at the expense of everything else. [Reference: The Rules Foundation 2012-2019]

Given the escalating climate emergency coupled with the foreboding warnings of the IPCC report, we must acknowledge that existing narratives about our relationship to Other and our Selves have led us astray. Indigenous cultures are ancient, deeply diverse and life centric, making them relevant alternatives to the fragile, calcified and destructive narratives of late stage Capitalism and Progress. In addition to this, Indigenous peoples are defenders of 80% of the world’s biodiversity and have shown that their territories are interwoven with their cultures. By protecting their Indigenous lives, cultures and territories, we will defend our collective future.
Listen: Collecting and Coding Data

In the “Listen” phase, we define how we collect and code data relevant to our PoV. We do this by particularizing our Point of View to the data collection process. We have done this by creating a listening model that defines what, where and how we collect data - for more detail on this you can see Appendix 1: Listening Model. Once we have collected the data, we code these communities using the System-Knowledge Framework, you can find out more about this in Appendix 2.

Our data collection began in August 2021 and lasted up to the first week of October of 2021. The data collected captured a conversation dating back to May of 2021. Importantly, we researched both English-speaking (mostly North America) and Spanish-speaking (mostly Latin America) narrative spaces to ensure that our data did not only reflect a Global North perspective. To use the platform, we had to identify a series of keywords to enter in the search engine. In our choice of keywords, we sought to find whether the current public conversation connects Indigenous activism and struggles with climate change - both in Spanish and English speaking spaces. For this, we looked at two types of conversations:

1. **Climate Change** (General): We tracked conversations around key events of the summer of 2021 like the release of the IPCC report. We also wanted to track the perspective of people who are not necessarily activists or involved in the climate change conversation but who are living in its effects. So we looked for conversations related to recent climate disasters such as hurricanes, fires, floods, fires, droughts, and we cross referenced them with mentions of “climate change”, “global warming”, etc.

2. **Indigenous Climate Spaces**: We also focused on Indigenous narrative spaces by looking at specific movements or current issues through keywords #Landback, #StopLine3, Indigenous people against carbon report, etc. We wanted to understand how Indigenous communities addressed climate change and/or connect it to their current problems or resistance.

The data led us to spend some time on social media, reading posts, looking at comments to get a better understanding of the conversation. We call this ‘small listening’, and while we
did not carry a full search, we did find a very active and booming Indigenous community on social media (twitter, instagram, tik tok), especially in North America, which we mention in our insights.
Understand: Mapping Communities and Identifying Frames

The “Understand” phase takes the collected data from our listening model and assembles a picture of the Communities in the Narrative Space. As we draw a map of communities, we are interested in highlighting the following criteria (for an understanding of how this is done see Appendix 1): Attention (topics that receive the most attention), Network (communities emerging around “nodes” in the conversation), Power (communities with the biggest voices in the narrative space).

Once these initial data processes have been conducted, we then endeavor to understand the semantic, symbolic and linguistic content of the most powerful or most interesting ‘narrative communities’ in the narrative space. This allows us to identify recurrent and persistent narrative frames.

As mentioned earlier, we have also employed the use of another data analytical tool, the narrative mapping framework (Appendix 2) to surface the deeper logics and power relations within the narrative space.

Communities in the Narrative Space

In this section, we describe the most prominent and most interesting communities, given our PoV. Mapping these on our System-Knowledge axes gives us an initial understanding of the dynamics of the space. For a detailed analysis of these communities, please see Appendix 3.

The table below describes the key communities that are present in the narrative space. We have named them according to the demographics of each community, placing emphasis on global regions and political inclination.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community Name</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A North American Indigenous Activists</td>
<td>Indigenous activists in the Global North are very active on social media, in particular around specific social movements. They have helped popularize notions of de-colonialism, territorial sovereignty and reparations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B Latin American Indigenous and Non Indigenous Activists</td>
<td>This community is made up of various communities in Latin America (Mexico, Brazil, Chile and Argentina). Some are led by Indigenous and others are not, but they all voice their support to Indigenous struggles and develop around Indigenous’ land guardianship and ownership.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C Global North Climate Activists &amp; Non Activists</td>
<td>A very diverse group of activists, Indigenous and non-Indigenous allies, BIPOC, young people from the Global North as well as progressive politicians who make a clear connection between systems of oppression, Indigenous struggle and climate change.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D Global North Climate Science Experts</td>
<td>The larger conversation around the IPCC report happened in various communities, mostly composed of scientists, experts and international institutions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E Climate Deniers</td>
<td>A community mostly present in the Global North who emerges in reaction to claims that climate change is real and scientific and that it requires a system change.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Taking these communities into account, we have mapped them onto the System-Knowledge Framework, outlined in Appendix 2, to conduct an initial and high level, narrative analysis of these five communities. The System-Knowledge Framework allows us to assess whether and to what extent a particular community is embracing other ways of Being and Knowing i.e. it is evolutionary potential. In the mapping below, we have additionally added the size and power of each community relative to the overall data set - this is visualized as the size of the community.
From this mapping, we can draw an initial understanding of the narrative space:

- The topography shows that the largest communities (C, D, A) are exploring alternatives to the system but are still rooted in traditional knowledge systems. This indicates that they have potential to evolve further on both axes of knowledge and system.
- Community C (Climate Activists) are seeking alternatives to the system but remain reactionary in their logic and have not fully explored alternative knowledge systems.
- Community B shows the highest evolutionary capacity within the narrative space, yet has low presence and power. This community has an important capacity to lead the narrative space to more evolutionary states.
- Community A (North American Indigenous Activists) is a community that is imbued with decolonial themes as they pertain to both Indigenous rights and climate change.
Recurrent Frames in the Narrative Space

Once we have identified the communities, we conducted a deeper linguistic and semiotic analysis of these communities and identified recurrent and persistent narrative frames. For a detailed analysis of this please see Appendix 4.

The table below identifies the recurrent frames in the narrative space from the collected data. Each of these frames can be correlated to specific communities, this is detailed in Appendix 3. In the table below, we have identified the metaphors and logics related to these recurrent frames. In addition we have added a column that identifies the power within the conversation (overall presence) and potential for evolution across knowledge and system spectrums.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frame Name</th>
<th>Frames, Metaphors &amp; Logics</th>
<th>Power / Potential</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F1 Land Defenders</td>
<td>Frame: <em>Life defenders</em>&lt;br&gt;The deeper logic here is “the defence of Indigenous rights is the defense of all life.”</td>
<td>Power - Medium Potential - High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F2 Reparation</td>
<td>Frame: <em>Give back what was taken</em>&lt;br&gt;The key logic here is asking for justice for a history of atrocities and injustices.</td>
<td>Power - Medium Potential - High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F3 Indigenous Rights</td>
<td>Frame: <em>Indigenous rights are rights of life</em>&lt;br&gt;This frame points to the relationship between Indigenous custodianship of lands and biodiversity. Moreover the atrocities against Indigenous people are linked here to atrocities against all life.</td>
<td>Power - Medium Potential - High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F4 Self Governance</td>
<td>Frame: <em>Self Organization &amp; Agency</em>&lt;br&gt;This frame centers notions of self-autonomy and decision-making power. It recognizes that Indigenous people offer alternatives to how we govern ourselves.</td>
<td>Power - Low Potential - Low</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F5 Living Alternatives</td>
<td>Frame: <em>Living alternatives to collapse</em>&lt;br&gt;The core logic here points to the very real alternative that Indigenous land defenders provide to imminent climate collapse. Protecting Indigenous cultures is protection of our future.</td>
<td>Power - Low Potential - High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F6 Name &amp; Shame</td>
<td>Frame: <em>Name the culprits of the Climate Emergency</em>&lt;br&gt;It is the US vs Them language that prevails within the youth global climate movement and activists whether it is in the North and South. It is about denouncing industries and Governments who are responsible for the climate crisis.</td>
<td>Power - High Potential - High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F7 System Change</td>
<td>Frame: <em>Change the system change the world</em>&lt;br&gt;The central logic points to systems of oppression and</td>
<td>Power - High Potential - High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
domination as the reasons for climate collapse. In this, it
asks for a revolution against these systems.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Climate Science</th>
<th>Frame: Trust Science</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F8</td>
<td></td>
<td>This frame is rooted in the authority of science, and asking for renewed recognition of the IPCC report.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Power: High Potential- High</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Once again, we can plot the eight frames along the System-Knowledge framework, described in Appendix 2. The size of the frames below are relative to the overall presence of these frames within the overall data set. We clustered frames according to their overarching themes, by color - those that center Indigenous voices, those that name climate culprits, the science focussed frames and climate deniers.

The mapping above shows that much of the narrative space is exploring alternatives to the system (except for Climate Deniers), but is still entrenched in a reactionary stance.

As we have explained (see Appendix 2), the goal of the System-Knowledge framework is to show the evolutionary potential of the narrative space. However, what do we actually mean by narrative evolution? Specifically we are referring to a stepwise change towards the upper right quadrant of the System-Knowledge Axis, a position that embraces many ways of knowing and being. Looking at this map, we can therefore observe and draw the following insights:
- The first cluster (F1-F5) that centers Indigenous voices has the greatest immediate potential for narrative evolution. These communities are already making the critical connection between Indigenous cultures, the stewardship of biodiverse regions and climate collapse.

- The second cluster (F6, F7) displays frames of opposition and logics of “Us vs. Them”, while exploring alternatives to systems of domination and control through a decolonial lens. This cluster is “almost there” in that they have identified the structural causes of climate change but have not transcended the oppositional logic that reinforces the system... to some degree.

- The ‘science’ frame, Climate Science (F8) is primarily reporting the findings of the IPCC report. Although the frame is embedded with an anxiety about the impending climate crises, it does connect these to alternatives that are outside the current systems of knowing and being. This community is a large, global community that has a great potential for narrative evolution.

As we consider that a narrative evolution or narrative shift is characterized by the adoption of alternative forms of being and knowing, we have also developed a framework that allows us to track this shift by describing three stations within any narrative space:

- **Almost there:** The “almost there’s” have begun connecting the dots between systems of domination, the narratives of progress and extraction and the current period of transition.

- **Just there:** Communities that are making the connections between the climate crisis, the narratives of progress and consumption and the ideologies that justify them, but they reproduce logics of the current system (Us vs Them) and are not yet emphasizing alternatives/solutions.

- **Catalysts:** These communities are already ‘there’, and are acting to communicate key aspects of the bigger picture of the transition to a post Anthropocentric world. However often these communities are too small and lack a coherent and shared narrative frame.

Here, we can identify three principle vectors for narrative evolution that are related to the three identified clusters. These vectors represent strategic communication directions for the narrative space.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Communities</th>
<th>Transformational Logic</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vector One</td>
<td>These communities are all discussing Indigineous issues and are the closest schematically to the ‘living alternatives’ frame of F5. Yet, they exist in the margins and lack cohesion. The ‘Living Alternatives’ frame may exist as a unifying frame across this cluster and a trope that can unite these smaller communities towards a unified goal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>[Catalysts]</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vector Two</td>
<td>In the narrative space, these two communities have used the term ‘system change’ to point to the deep structural issues related to the climate emergency. However, they are still embedded in the current system (Us vs Them).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>[Just There]</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vector Three</td>
<td>This largest community is entrenched in the logic and justification of Science. It is almost there because it does not sufficiently point to the systems that are at play in the current climate crisis. The community’s frame is alarmist in nature and communicates the “climate emergency” narrative.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>[Almost There]</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Summary of Insights**

As we conclude our data analysis, we also offer below a summary of what we believe are important takeaways from our data research. As a result, they can complement the community and frame analysis above.

**Climate Change and Indigenous struggles are still separate conversations.** During the time period of our data search, we noticed peaks in both conversations. Yet, they did not intersect. For the conversation on climate change, the peaks correspond to relevant “moments” such as climate-related disasters, an experts report, a documentary, the construction of an oil pipeline, etc. For instance, we observed a peak in August 2021, the month when the IPCC report was issued. We also saw a peak when the world witnessed many climate disasters across the globe: fires, droughts, hurricanes, etc. On the contrary, as we searched for conversations related to Indigenous people, we observed peaks of June 2021 and September 2021. In June, the world found out about the bodies of Indigenous children buried in former Canadian residential schools. On September 30, Canada commemorated Orange Shirt Day, a day to commemorate the lives of Indigenous children who endured the residential school system. Yet, too little mention was made of the link between this violence and our planet’s collapse.

**The role of Indigenous people in protecting the planet is being recognized, but they do not lead the conversation.** Progressive people in Latin America and North America support Indigenous’ resistance and recognize their role in protecting the land. Institutions like the
UN also recognize the importance that Indigenous people play in protecting the planet’s biodiversity. Yet, Indigenous people are not leading this conversation. They are being talked about, not listened to.

**The climate change conversation is led by experts and activists from the Global North.** Four of the most active communities we identified are located in the Global North. While we did find communities in Latin America, they were not as prominent as the ones in North America.

**In the Global North, young climate activists and young progressives are linking climate change and systems of oppression.** In the North, it is more and more accepted that climate change is the result of a variety of systems of oppression that are all connected. As a result, what is needed is an overhaul of capitalism, neoliberalism, white supremacy and the legacy of colonialism. The culprits are being denounced: the fossil fuel industry, silent and corrupt Governments, the 1%, etc.

**Climate deniers often emerge in reaction to progressive language and claims of “system change”**. While progressives in the North growingly adopt the language of system change, we noticed a clear backlash from right wing spaces both in English and Spanish speaking networks.

**Public opinion in the Global North is only recently coming to realize the impact of climate change on their daily lives.** While the Global South is the most impacted by climate change, and is already experiencing its catastrophic consequences, public opinion in the Global North seems to only recently realize that they too will be impacted by climate change. For too long, the Global North has ignored the effects of climate change in the Global South.

**The connection between climate change and natural disasters is increasingly accepted.** We found that the natural disasters of 2021 were almost immediately linked to climate change. And this may be a result of the fact that the Global North is also now experiencing the effects of climate change.

**English Indigenous spaces are more active online than Indigenous communities from the Global South.** There are a number of possible reasons for that. In North America, Indigenous spaces are also led by young people who have grown up using social media (twitter, tiktok and instagram). This younger generation knows the language of pop culture (memes, video clips, etc.). They have used these platforms to voice their opinions and opposition to oil/gas industry projects like - recently - TransMountain in Canada or line3 in the US. In fact, these English-speaking spaces have contributed to making the language of decolonization and system change more mainstream. We have not yet found an equivalent community in the spanish-speaking world.
Past and current Government-sponsored violence against Indigenous people is growingly recognized and denounced. When Canadians found out this year about yet another testament of the violence of residential schools towards Indigenous children, the whole world reacted. Public opinion in the South and the North are growingly denouncing Government-sponsored violence against Indigenous people, whether it is in the past or today. In fact, this is where we notice the connection is made with the ongoing climate crisis.

**Key Tactical Insights**

If we go back to our PoV, we can observe that the frame “Indigenous land defenders are living alternatives to the climate collapse” exists only in the margins, as the current narrative space is dominated by the Global North: the language of experts and the logics of naming and shaming. There are however opportunities for narrative evolution. The need for system change has been embraced by a growing community of young activists, and Indigenous people (mostly in the Global North) are also part of this community. More than ever, there is also a reckoning of the atrocities of the past and a willingness to connect struggles. This is an opportunity to firmly establish the link between indigenous struggles and climate change: colonization killed Indigenous communities and in the process, killed the planet.

We see a series of imperatives:

- Build a unitary front behind the Indigenous-led frame: Indigenous land defenders are living alternatives to climate collapse
- Elevate and strengthen voices of the Global South, Indigenous voices (the “Catalysts” communities)
- Continue to connect the current systems of oppression with the atrocities committed against Indigenous communities and the current climate crisis.
- Beyond naming and shaming, The “Just There” communities need to show the alternatives that already exist on this planet - Indigenous-led alternatives that offer us a real shift in how we relate with nature and other species.
- The “Almost There” community (the scientists and experts) must recognize and support Indigenous land defenders’ role in protecting our ecosystem (the catalyst communities)

In the next sections, we bear in mind these Insights, and we further detail how to target the three different community clusters (Tactical Summary). We then articulate the new frames (Recode) that can accelerate the narrative evolution.
Tactical Summary: where to focus energy and how

We can draw from our analysis of communities and frames to offer guidance as to where and how to concentrate efforts and energy for future communication strategies.

- **The “Just There” communities (System Change & Name Change):** These communities are young, diverse and quite active in the narrative space. As such, they offer great opportunities for actions and interventions. In addition, this is a cluster of communities that understands the systems that have catapulted the crisis - the same systems that have tried to erase and eradicate Indigenous cultures. They demand an overhaul. However, in their demand for change, they stay within a Us vs Them logic that can only do so much to prompt change. Beyond ‘naming and shaming’, we ought to show the alternatives that already exist on this planet, and which are offering us a real shift in how we relate with nature and other species. This is what Indigenous land defenders are offering us. Any action targeting this community should:
  - Leverage their power and influence
  - Leverage their understanding of systems and recognition of Indigenous struggle
  - Encourage them to elevate Indigenous-centred alternatives (connect them with the catalyst communities)

- **The “Almost There” community (Climate Science)*** is the largest community, and as such it also offers great potential for intervention. Anything that this community communicates will be efficiently and rapidly relayed. They are listened to. However, this community is still dominated by policy makers, diplomats and institutions that have not been strong enough in naming and condemning the culprits of climate change. In comparison to the “Just There’s”, they do not sufficiently bring in a system analysis. Yet, there is potential in that they do recognize the role of Indigenous people in protecting the planet. Any action targeting this community should:
  - Leverage their power and influence
  - Leverage their authority and legitimacy
  - Make them relay and embrace the messages of the young communities within the “Just There” cluster.
  - Ask them to vocally recognize and support Indigenous land defenders’ role in protecting our ecosystem (the catalyst communities)

- **The Catalysts** is the cluster of communities that deserves most attention. This cluster includes voices from the Global South and voices of Indigenous land defenders from both the Global North and Global South. Emboldening and strengthening this cluster is important to address the fact that the Global North and
Climate experts are currently dominating the narrative space. However, the communities that are part of this cluster are quite small, disjointed and disparate. While they also hold a system analysis like the “Just There” cluster, they have begun to center the voices of Indigenous activists (in fact, Indigenous land defenders are part of these communities). They know that this is where solutions and alternatives to the imminent climate collapse exist. Yet, they have not made this frame a vector of connection between North and South. In short, communication strategies should:

- Prioritize actions that elevate and strengthen this cluster (voices of the Global South, Indigenous voices)
- Build a unitary front behind the Indigenous-led frame: Indigenous land defenders are living alternatives to climate collapse
- Center this cluster in all actions related to the other clusters (Just There and Almost There)
**Recode: Frames, Mediums & Messages**

“Unity lies in no essence. It lies in the task of building good living/buen vivir. Herein reside the novelty and the political imperative: to enlarge contemporaneity means to amplify the field of reciprocity between the principle of equality and the principle of the recognition of difference. Thus, the struggle for social justice expands in unsuspected ways.” *Boaventura de Sousa Santos*

The Recode phase of our methodology takes the strategic insights from the Understand phase and identifies new frames that can be embedded in the narrative space through interventions (see Existing Projects).

We recall that our goal is to prompt a “narrative evolution”. We therefore seek to articulate frames that can move our global culture towards a life-centric approach where all life is prioritized over wealth accumulation, consumption and domination. For this shift to happen, we believe in the necessity to embrace other forms of knowing and being (epistemologies) that can radically change our culture, which today still rests on the legacy of colonialism & genocide.

Following this direction for narrative evolution, we articulate three interlocking frames that communicate a new narrative arc and catalyze change in the narrative space.

**Frame 1. Indigenous Land Defenders are Living Alternatives to Climate Collapse**

This is the frame that we have already articulated in our PoV. It is the frame that Indigenous land defenders have been bringing to the forefront, and that we have seen emerge in our listening of the narrative space.

**Logic:** This frame rests on a now commonly accepted logic: Indigenous peoples represent 6% of the global population, and Indigenous territories contain 80% of the remaining biodiversity on the planet. Indigenous cultures, wisdom and territories are the alternatives to the climate collapse. When we listen and join their struggle, we are preserving our
collective future on this planet. At the core of this frame is the recognition that our Western knowledge systems will not help us, and we must find the alternatives to this knowledge within Indigenous epistemologies. Yet, in recovering knowledge, we must not lead, we must heed.

Who can move there: We saw this frame being embraced by the Climate Science Communities (Almost There) and the System Change Community (Just There). This frame needs to be front and center of their messaging and communication. Solidarity and support around Indigenous land defenders is more than ever essential.

In short:

A. Name the diversity of Indigenous land defenders & tell the crises from their perspectives.
B. Amplify Indigenous voices and epistemologies, don’t be an intermediary.
C. Visibilize actions in defense of life and territories as a living alternative to the climate crisis.

Frame 2. The Climate Emergency is a Consequence

The second frame is a direct attempt to shift the current framing of the climate crisis as “a human responsibility.” This framing does not sufficiently point towards the history of current systems of oppression and the deep structural inequalities that have catapulted us towards the brink of collective extinction. Yes, humans are responsible for climate change, but this responsibility is not shared by all.

Logic: framing the climate emergency as a consequence allows to highlight the various systems and powers that have caused the crisis and benefit from it still today. It moves away from an observing and passive position (climate change is real and happening) to a more active voice that assigns responsibility and hence pinpoints where solutions can be.

Who can move there: The Name/Shame and System Change community are already framing the climate emergency as a consequence. The principal target for this frame is the Climate Scientists & Experts community, in particular international institutions such as the UN or the IPCC.

In short:

A. Tell the story of the crisis as a symptom, not as a disease.
B. Intersectional storytelling of the climate crisis and the structural inequalities.
C. Name the responsibility proportional to the privileges.

Frame 3. The Climate Crisis is a product of the machine of extermination

This third frame builds upon a growing demand for recognition and justice for the atrocities
committed against Indigenous people during colonization (frame of “Reparation”, see above). The atrocities continue to be committed today in the form of extractivism, structural racism from the Nation States, murdering and repression of land defenders, and the imposition of ‘progress’ and ‘development’ even from the ‘green economies’. This frame is important to link the past and present, and it reveals how little has changed. In addition, this frame must serve to emphasize once again that the crimes against Indigenous people are directly connected to the harm done to our environment (loss of biodiversity, natural disasters, carbon emissions, monocultures, etc.). The genocide led to an ecocide.

**Logic:** The logic of this frame continues to correct assumptions on the responsibility for climate change. By naming violence (a violence exerted by institutions of wealth and power, including the State), it connects struggles: the same violence that was exerted against Indigenous people is the same violence applied against the earth, and it is the same violence that represses whoever disputes power.

**Who can move there:** This frame, while somewhat antagonistic, can truly galvanize actions as it can speak to many communities in the Global South and the Global North. While activists in the Global North and South can embrace this frame quite easily (some already are), the Almost There communities (climate scientists & experts) are those who must provide context to their findings and data: the increase in carbon emission rates, the exhaustion of our planet’s resources and the loss of biodiversity were made possible because of the genocide and ecocide.

**In short:**

A. Name the genocide, past and present.
B. Name the ecocide, past and present.
C. Climate justice = stop the extermination = abolish structural inequality

**Existing Projects**

During the COP26 look at these nodes of organizing and communications lead by indigenous culture hackers. More information in the keynote section.

- Demarcação Já - APIB (Articulation of Indigenous Peoples of Brazil).
- Defensoras de la Tierra - Futuros Indígenas (México)
- Cura da Terra - Global Gathering of Indigenous Women (International)
- Land Back - Indigenous Resistances in North America (USA)
- Stop Line 3 - Indigenous Resistances against oil expansion (USA)

Projects by supporters:

- Casa Ninja Amazônia - Midia Ninja (Brasil)
- Our Village - If not us then who? (International)
Appendices

Appendix 1: Listening Model 23
Appendix 2: System-Knowledge Framework 25
Appendix 3: Community Analysis 27
  3.0. Key Communities in the Narrative Space 27
  3.A. North American Indigenous Activists 28
  3.B. Global North Climate Activists & Non Activists 29
  3.C. Global North Climate Activists & Non Activists 31
  3.D Global North Climate Science Experts 33
  3.E. Climate Deniers 34
Appendix 4: Detailed Frame Analysis 35
Appendix 5 - Data that illustrate the frames and communities 37
Appendix 1: Listening Model

The listening model will have two broad objectives:

1. To track communities that are already communicating these core ideas. The aim here will be to identify their frames and their impact in the narrative space.
2. To track the ‘broad’ narrative landscape, that is defining the key narratives and themes that we have identified as important, or potentially ‘hackable’.

Given the above data collection imperatives, we employed several data collection tools:
- Culture Hack data tools and platform
- Manual collections

The table below defines the key search criteria, the method of collection and related objective.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Narrative</th>
<th>Search Criteria (English)</th>
<th>Obj</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Cop 26</td>
<td>&quot;COP26&quot; + &quot;COP 26&quot; + &quot;COP-26&quot; + #COP26</td>
<td>Aug-Oct 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Indigenous</td>
<td>“Indigenous” + &quot;Indigenous Peoples&quot;</td>
<td>Aug-Oct 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Climate</td>
<td>“Climate change” + &quot;climate Collapse&quot; + &quot;climate emergency&quot; + &quot;climate crisis&quot; + #climatechange + #climatecrisis + #climateemergency + #climatecollapse</td>
<td>Aug-Oct 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Indigenous + CC</td>
<td>“Indigenous” + ( &quot;climate change&quot; OR &quot;climate crisis&quot; OR &quot;climate emergency” OR &quot;climate collapse&quot;)</td>
<td>Aug-Oct 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Land Defenders</td>
<td>“land defender” + “land defense” + “defenders of the land”</td>
<td>Aug-Oct 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Indigenous day</td>
<td>#IndigenousDay #IndigenousPeoplesDay #IndigenousPeoples #IndigenousRights #WeAreIndigenous</td>
<td>Aug-Oct 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7 IPCC</td>
<td>“IPCC” + #IPCC + #IPCCFindings + #ClimateReport</td>
<td>Aug-Oct 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Narrative</th>
<th>Search Criteria (Spanish)</th>
<th>Obj</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Cop 26</td>
<td>&quot;COP26&quot; + &quot;COP 26&quot; + &quot;COP-26&quot; + #COP26</td>
<td>Aug-Oct 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Indígena</td>
<td>“Indígena” + “indígenas” + “pueblos indígenas” + “naciones indígenas” + “nación indígena”</td>
<td>Aug-Oct 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Cambio Climático</td>
<td>“Cambio climático” + “crisis climática” + “emergencia climática” + “colapso climático” + #cambioclímático + #crisisclimática + #emergenciaclimática + #colapsoclimático</td>
<td>Aug-Oct 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Indígena + CC</td>
<td>“Indígena” OR “indígenas” + “climática” OR #cambioclímático #crisisclimática + #emergenciaclimática</td>
<td>Aug-Oct 2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Land Defenders</th>
<th>#SomosIndigenas #DiaPueblosIndígenas</th>
<th>#PueblosIndígenas</th>
<th>#DiaDeLosPueblosIndígenas</th>
<th>Aug-Oct</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>“defensa del territorio” + “defensor” OR “defensora” OR “defensores” AND “territorio”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td><strong>Dia de los Pueblos Indígenas</strong></td>
<td>#SomosIndigenas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>#DiaPueblosIndígenas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>#PueblosIndígenas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>#DiaDeLosPueblosIndígenas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>IPCC</td>
<td>#IPCC + #InformeClimático</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Once the data is collected using the above criteria of the listening model, we begin to map the data, communities and ideas. Our methodology maps the narrative space along three primary lines:

1. **Attention** - This analytic approach seeks to understand how much attention the specific topic receives in general. Using this approach we are interested in understanding general “peaks and troughs” of the narrative landscape. This allows us to gain an initial and high level of the evolution of the narrative space.

2. **Network** - We then model the narrative space as a network, using two different network operations. The first one uses the human actors as nodes, modelling the network of relationships between human actors. The second operation models the network based on the relationship of domains, building the network based on the relationship between websites.

3. **Power** - Once we have done the above analyses we can model recurrent or persistent communities (which we sometimes call ‘echo chambers’) and see which ones have the biggest voices within the narrative space. We call this their ‘power metric’ which tells us where power lies within the narrative space.
Appendix 2: System-Knowledge Framework

As we have outlined in the Ask and Listen sections, a key research objective is to map narrative communities according to their relationship to the current system and also to ways of knowing (or systems of knowledge). This mapping between ways of ‘knowing’ and modes of ‘being’, is essentially a mapping of power relations and the potential for capacities for cultural evolution.

To help contextualize this mapping, we can turn to Boaventura de Sousa Santos’, The End of the Cognitive Empire: the Coming of Age of Epistemologies of the South. According to Santos, three modes of modern domination—capitalism, colonialism and patriarchy—still rule worldly relations and work together to maintain those power-based relations. They feed on the conception of knowledge as being single and unique, forged by European modernity leading to what he terms “the cognitive empire”. He states that mechanisms of struggle and resistance have to be acknowledged and privileged to overcome such a world order, while insisting of the intersectionality of such potential struggles, relying on a common experience of oppression, whether it concern feminist, LGBTQ, social or racial exclusion.

To operationalize this political position we have developed the System-Knowledge axis, that is defined by two complementary spectrums:

System Spectrum
The system spectrum maps ‘narrative communities’ that have the following relationship to the current systems of domination (capitalism, colonialism and patriarchy):
   a. Narrative communities that are reinforcing these systems
   b. Narrative communities that are complementary to these systems
   c. Those that are actively seeking and providing alternatives to these systems
   d. Finally, those narrative communities that recognize that embrace regenerative systems - that many alternatives to one system is essential for survival and life

Knowledge Spectrum
The knowledge spectrum maps these narrative communities that have the following relationship with the ‘cognitive empire’, or a singular way of knowing:
   a. Communities that are firmly rooted within the legacy of The Enlightenment and Modernism, and its consequent epistemological monism.
   b. Narrative communities that discuss laws and policies related to the narrative space. This knowledge type is also rooted in the current systems and aims for incremental changes to policy and law.
c. Popular cultures are intrinsically heterogeneous and these communities represent a diversity of knowledge types, as populist narratives
d. This final station on the spectrum believes that multiple knowledge systems are necessary for
### Appendix 3: Community Analysis

#### 3.0. Key Communities in the Narrative Space

The following five communities have been identified by our listening model as important for narrative intervention.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community Name</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A</strong> North American Indigenous Activists</td>
<td>Indigenous activists in the Global North are very active on social media, in particular around specific social movements. They have helped popularize notions of de-colonialism, territorial sovereignty and reparations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>B</strong> Latin American Indigenous and Non Indigenous Activists</td>
<td>This community is made up of various communities in Latin America (Mexico, Brazil, Chile and Argentina). Some are led by Indigenous and others are not, but they all voice their support to Indigenous struggles and develop around Indigenous’ land guardianship and ownership.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C</strong> Global North Climate Activists &amp; Non Activists</td>
<td>A very diverse group of activists, Indigenous and non-Indigenous allies, BIPOC, young people from the Global North as well as progressive politicians who make a clear connection between systems of oppression, Indigenous struggle and climate change.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>D</strong> Global North Climate Science Experts</td>
<td>The larger conversation around the IPCC report happened in various communities, mostly composed of scientists, experts and international institutions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>E</strong> Climate Deniers</td>
<td>A community mostly present in the Global North who emerges in reaction to claims that climate change is real and scientific and that it requires a system change.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 3.A. North American Indigenous Activists

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top Ngrams</th>
<th>Keywords (Collection Criteria)</th>
<th>Collection Dates</th>
<th>Main Nodes</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Influence</th>
<th>Appendix (Content)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>A1</strong></td>
<td>“Water Protectors” StopLine3” + “TreatiesNotTar Sands” + &quot;climate change&quot;</td>
<td>September 7 - October 10 2021</td>
<td>@KanahsFreedom @HonorTheEarth @heather28df @ziibiing @IENearth</td>
<td>Among this diverse community of progressive voices, we have found Indigenous groups and allies opposing megaprojects like Pipeline 3 in Canada. They push forward concepts of decolonization. They make the connection between violence against Indigenous people (especially women), oil industry and environmental destruction is made</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td><strong>H</strong> A.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A2</strong></td>
<td>“Nice heard” #LandBack</td>
<td>September 7 - October 10, 2021</td>
<td>@gindaanis</td>
<td>Indigenous groups and allies against Trans Mountain Pipeline 3. They are claiming #landback to stop pipelines. They are denouncing the surveillance &amp; violence exerted on Indigenous people to dispossess them of their land.. Indigenous people are protecting their land. “They can’t remove us from our lands”</td>
<td>0.23</td>
<td>1 A.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>A3</strong></td>
<td>“National day” #orangeshirtday</td>
<td>September 7 - October 10, 2021</td>
<td>@_IllumiNative</td>
<td>A community that emerged on the national day (Sept 30) to commemorate the killing and mistreatment of Indigenous children in Canadian residential schools.</td>
<td>0.28</td>
<td>1 A.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.B. Global North Climate Activists & Non Activists

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Top Ngrams</th>
<th>Keywords (collection criteria)</th>
<th>Collection Dates</th>
<th>Main Nodes</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Influence</th>
<th>Content</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>B1</td>
<td>&quot;Crisis Climatica&quot;</td>
<td>#FuturosIndígenas, &quot;futuros indígenas&quot;</td>
<td>September 7 - October 10, 2021</td>
<td>@Ambulante @buscandolatrufa @davidhpalmar @Dal_air</td>
<td>A small, radical group of Indigenous communicators that seeks to frame Indigenous Land Defenders as living alternatives to climate collapse.</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>B.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B2</td>
<td>&quot;Defensoras Territorio&quot;</td>
<td>Futuros Indígenas&quot; OR #FuturosIndígenas OR #CuraDeLaTierra</td>
<td>September 7 - October 10, 2021</td>
<td>@RadioZapote @CNstme @Ambulante @davidhpalmar</td>
<td>Latin American activists spreading Indigenous message: the future is a territory to defend “El futuro es un territorio a defender”</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>B.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B3</td>
<td>Yanomami Lideres</td>
<td>“Indígena” + “indígenas” + “pueblos indígenas” + “naciones indígenas” + “nación indígena”</td>
<td>September 7 - October 10, 2021</td>
<td>@Lula_Oficial @prof_rosaneide @Rafaelroxo4</td>
<td>Brazilian public opinion including former President Lula calling out the systematic oppression of Indigenous people in defense of their lands. Original tweet came from Lula's account. “A country that does not respect its aboriginal people cannot go forward.”</td>
<td>0.26</td>
<td>B.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B4</td>
<td>&quot;Povos Indígenas&quot;</td>
<td>“Indígena” + “indígenas” + “pueblos indígenas” +</td>
<td>September 7 - October 10, 2021</td>
<td>@helenapalmquis @acetatodeodio @tamiresdiias6</td>
<td>Brazilian Indigenous and non-Indigenous communities talking about Canadian Residential schools. The post at the origin of this community was posted by an</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>B.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“naciones indígenas” + “nación indígena”</td>
<td>@Karibuxi @lev_jf</td>
<td>Indigenous person. Acknowledgement of the important role Indigenous people play in protecting the earth.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B5</td>
<td>“Crisis Climática”</td>
<td>“Indígena” + “indígenas” + “pueblos indígenas” + “naciones indígenas” + “nación indígena”</td>
<td>September 7 - October 10, 2021</td>
<td>@Liz_dicr @tihui @Elisaloncon @MarusiaLC</td>
<td>Latin American activists and general public growingly recognizing the importance of Indigenous people in dismantling systems of oppression “Los pueblos indígenas nos están mostrando cómo ejercer la lucha colectiva.”</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### 3.C. Global North Climate Activists & Non Activists

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top Ngrams</th>
<th>Keywords (collection criteria)</th>
<th>Collection Dates</th>
<th>Main Nodes</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Influence</th>
<th>Content</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>C1</strong></td>
<td>“Change Real”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>A space overly represented by US democrats ringing the alarm on climate change. They are emphasizing that “climate change is real, it’s urgent, and we have to act.”</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>C2</strong></td>
<td>“Climate Change”</td>
<td>September 7 - October 10, 2021</td>
<td>@COP26 @Sustaintrends @GretaThunberg @NataliesSurely @NamugerwaLeah @vanessa_vash @ClimateHuman @jasonhickel @the_ecofeminist @FFFMAPA</td>
<td>Global North activists and institutions warning about the urgency of climate change. Big community originates in Greta Thunberg’s tweet and the account of COP 26. This community is quite driven by young people. They use Us vs Them language to denounce those responsible for climate (fossil fuel industry, mostly) and those who have kept it under silence (governments). See Blah, blah, blah: Greta Thunberg lambasts leaders over climate crisis. We also see stories from the Global South emerge in this community and many highlight the difference of treatment with climate news from the Global North “Climate Change has not &quot;arrived.&quot; It has been here for decades &amp; now the Global North is also being impacted.”</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C3</td>
<td>“Residential Schools”</td>
<td>“Indigenous” + “Indigenous Peoples”</td>
<td>September 5, 2021 - October 8, 2021</td>
<td>@AmitAryaMD @WordsandGuitar @ddouglasnl @asantetalks</td>
<td>Global North communities reacting to the bodies of Indigenous children being found in former residential schools in Canada.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C4</td>
<td>“Indigenous People”</td>
<td>Indigenous Peoples Day</td>
<td>September 5, 2021 - October 8, 2021</td>
<td>@yknikyhsrlig @MumilaaqQaqqaq</td>
<td>Small community of activists/progressive politicians from Canada asking for investigation of Canada’s crime against Indigenous people.</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A1</td>
<td>Water protectors</td>
<td>StopLine3” + “TreatiesNotTales” + “climate change”</td>
<td>September 7 - October 10, 2021</td>
<td>@jameiclima @moira_kb @grumpygrumpyowl @HonorTheEarth @JoshuaPotash @UR_NINJA @MaryHeglar @sunrisemvt @JavierBlas</td>
<td>This community mostly consists of people in the Global North criticizing and denouncing those who are responsible for climate change: fossil fuel industry, corrupt institutions and governments that kept the data secret. These are typically Bernie Sanders &amp; AOC supporters in the US. They are connecting the climate crisis with systems of oppression. They are asking for system change. Most of them are young people and BIPOC. It is also where we find English-speaking Indigenous spaces. (see above) They are expressing solidarity with Indigenous struggles, and understand how they connect to climate change.</td>
<td>0,81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C5</td>
<td>“Breaking IPCC”</td>
<td>IPCC, ClimateReport, ClimateReality</td>
<td>September 5, 2021 - October 8, 2021</td>
<td>@climatereality @GretaThunberg</td>
<td>Global North activists reacting to the IPCC report and emphasizing the obvious; it is an emergency. Greta Thunberg initiated this community with her post being RT 12.4 times.</td>
<td>0,19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.D Global North Climate Science Experts

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top Ngrams</th>
<th>Keywords (collection criteria)</th>
<th>Collection Dates</th>
<th>Main Nodes</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Influence</th>
<th>Appendix (Content)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>D1</strong></td>
<td>“Join Scientists” 1</td>
<td>#IPCC + #ReporteClimático</td>
<td>September 5 - October 10 2021</td>
<td>@IPPC_CH @jurassicg1rl @climatekic @fwn_science</td>
<td>Climate activists and organizations in the Global North reacting to the IPCC report. RT of the IPCC twitter account. We found one mention of the role of Indigenous people in protecting the planet.</td>
<td>1.0 1.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Join Scientists” 2</td>
<td>“IPCC” + #IPCC + #IPCCFindings + #ClimateReport</td>
<td>September 5 - October 10, 2021</td>
<td>@Iremonasterolo @DRKateMarvel @IPPC_CH</td>
<td>Experts in the English speaking world, talking about the gravity of the IPCC report and emphasizing the scientific bases of the climate crisis. It is real, it is happening.</td>
<td>0.9 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Join Scientists” 3</td>
<td>IPCC, ClimateReport, ClimateReality</td>
<td>September 5 - October 10, 2021</td>
<td>@Iremonasterolo @DRKateMarvel @IPPC_CH</td>
<td>Experts in the English speaking world, talking about the gravity of the IPCC report and emphasizing the scientific bases of the climate crisis. It is real, it is happening. Tweets are coming from institutions like the IPCC or UN. There is expression of fear and anxiety in this community.</td>
<td>0.72 0.53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>D2</strong></td>
<td>“Today’s Report”</td>
<td>“IPCC” + #IPCC +#IPCCFindings +#ClimateReport</td>
<td>September 5 - October 10, 2021</td>
<td>@fossiltreaty @GlobalJusticeUK</td>
<td>Global North science activists. Conversation around specific actions against culprits of climate change, mostly fossil fuels.</td>
<td>0.13 0.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>D3</strong></td>
<td>“Extreme Weather”</td>
<td></td>
<td>September 5 - October 10, 2021</td>
<td></td>
<td>Experts of scientific spaces talking about specific cases of extreme climate as a symptom and proof of climate change. UK and US based.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.E. Climate Deniers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top Ngrams</th>
<th>Keywords (collection criteria)</th>
<th>Collection Dates</th>
<th>Main Nodes</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Influence</th>
<th>Appendix (Content)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>E1</td>
<td>“Denying Climate”</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Various public figures US based denying climate change, particularly republicans. “Revealing the climate fraud and the science-based claims.</td>
<td>Bet, Eig</td>
<td>E.1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Appendix 4: Detailed Frame Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frame Name</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Communities</th>
<th>Narrative Lense</th>
<th>Narrative Presence</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>F1 Land Defenders</td>
<td>Indigenous people protect the land and the earth.</td>
<td>A1 Water Protectors, B4 Povos Indígenas, D1 Join Scientists</td>
<td>Language of decolonization, reparations for injustices. Metaphors and frames of guardianship, protection and stewardship. Indigenous people protect the land, and yet they are still being killed and oppressed.</td>
<td>This frame is very much used in North American contexts, but it is growingly recognized by human rights institutions like the UN. You find emergence of this frame in the Global South (See Brazilian reaction to atrocities committed to Indigenous people)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F2 Reparations</td>
<td>Indigenous people deserve justice for past massacres and long-standing oppression.</td>
<td>C4 Indigenous people, A1 Water Protectors</td>
<td>Similar to the frame above, we are in the lexicon of justice and reparations. This is a frame that exists because public opinion is learning about more crimes committed against Indigenous people by former colonial powers.</td>
<td>This is a frame pushed by English-speaking Indigenous spaces. It has become more prevalent as more news of Government massacres and violence against Indigenous people is coming to light. It is opening another avenue in the narrative space to talk about climate change.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F3 Indigenous Rights</td>
<td>The violence enacted against Indigenous people is the same violence enacted against the planet.</td>
<td>B4 Povos Indígenas, C3 Residential Schools</td>
<td>This frame exists very much in reaction to Government violence against Indigenous people: the mass grave of Indigenous children in Canada's former residential schools or the repression by police and military against land defenders in Mexico. It does not always connect violence against Indigenous with violence against the earth, but when it does, the imagery and messages are powerful. Key Frame - Indigenous Peoples are bound to Life</td>
<td>This is a frame pushed by English-speaking Indigenous spaces. Yet, we found some examples in Latin American spaces (Brazilian data community). It has become more prevalent as more news of Government massacres and violence against Indigenous people is coming to light. It is opening another avenue in the narrative space to talk about climate change.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F4 Self Governance</td>
<td>Indigenous People show us how to fight for our rights.</td>
<td>B5 Crisis Climática</td>
<td>This frame centers notions of self-autonomy and decision-making power. It recognizes that Indigenous people offer alternatives to how we govern ourselves. Key Frame: Self Sufficiency &amp; Autonomy</td>
<td>This frame is much more present in Latin American spaces in our research.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frame</td>
<td>Descriptions</td>
<td>Communities</td>
<td>Narrative Lense</td>
<td>Narrative Presence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F5</td>
<td>Living Alternatives</td>
<td>Indigenous land defenders represent living and existing alternatives to environmental destruction</td>
<td>B1 Crisis climatica B2 Defensoras Territorio</td>
<td>Instead of emphasizing the morbid nature of the climate crisis, the emphasis is on the possibility for an alternative reality, which Indigenous people already hold. Frame: Living Alternatives to Collapse</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F6</td>
<td>Name &amp; Shame</td>
<td>We must denounce those who benefit from environmental collapse</td>
<td>A1 Water Protectors A2 Nice Heard C2 Climate Change</td>
<td>It is the US vs Them language that prevails within the youth global climate movement and activists whether it is in the North and South. It is about denouncing industries and Governments who are responsible for the climate crisis. Frame: Name the culprits of the Climate Emergency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F7</td>
<td>System Change</td>
<td>System change is necessary to stop climate change</td>
<td>A1 Water Protectors</td>
<td>This frame expands the above frame by connecting different movements and systems of oppression. Indigenous people do not lead the conversation here, but there is solidarity with their struggle. Important to note that “system change” comes from left activists/academics and became the language of the Youth climate movement and it’s becoming the language of progressive politics (See Jeremy Corbyn)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F8</td>
<td>Climate Science</td>
<td>Climate collapse is a real imminent emergency.</td>
<td>C1 Change Real C2 Climate Change C5 Breaking IPCC D1 Join Scientists D2 Today’s Report D3 Extreme Weather</td>
<td>This is the frame that we see whenever there is a climate related event like a disaster or a report like the IPCC It stresses the emergency, the imminent nature of climate change, and it is the frame that is backed by science and hard data. It also includes the lexicon of apocalypse with frequent terms like “doomed, “dooming”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 5 - Data that illustrate the frames and communities

A.1
https://twitter.com/ResistLine3/status/1444712719211536389
https://twitter.com/HonorTheEarth/status/1389934166003834882
https://twitter.com/salfek/status/1440123430658093060
https://www.vogue.com/article/letter-from-a-jailed-line-3-water-protector
A.2
https://twitter.com/j/web/status/1424592731628703750
https://www.facebook.com/watch/?v=935295826918799
https://twitter.com/KanahusFreedom
B.1
“Hackear la crisis climática: el futuro es indígena”
https://futurosindigenas.org/
Defensoras del territorio crean red de Futuros Indígenas contra
B.2
https://twitter.com/j/web/status/1401383512184266760
-un-futuro-mejor
mo/
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=DeoXxcFhq2o
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SPdmvYBtvuE
B.3
https://twitter.com/j/web/status/1407443670509494274
https://revistaforum.com.br/movimentos/lula-repudia-ataque-da-pm-a-indigenas-no-df-in
aceitavel-a-covardia/
dia-acao-da-pm-contra-indigenas-no-df
B.4
https://twitter.com/j/web/status/1399359384187248646
https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=U_NdowHmsE
https://twitter.com/j/web/status/1409580082344218630
B.5
https://twitter.com/j/web/status/140168093638460422
“las comunidades se encaminan al autogobierno basado en los usos y costumbres de los
pueblos originarios.”
https://twitter.com/j/web/status/1412073805699244034
Mapuche woman to lead body drafting Chile’s new constitution
C.1
https://twitter.com/amyklobuchar/status/1422277580561043457?ref_src=twsrс%5Etfw
Climate change is real, and it’s permanent
C.2
https://twitter.com/j/web/status/1401639687022841856
https://twitter.com/j/web/status/139747526749330227
https://twitter.com/j/web/status/139793962319631747
https://twitter.com/j/web/status/1399082726179885060
Climate Report Exposes Fault Lines Within Fossil Fuel Industry
Blah, blah, blah*: Greta Thunberg lambasts leaders over climate crisis
https://www.facebook.com/ExtinctionRebellion/posts/189969129914934
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/141902623343325190
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1397982140915138564
https://twitter.com/the_ecofeminist/status/1404161675402616832
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1416114365758156802
WHAT IS MAPA AND WHY SHOULD WE PAY ATTENTION TO IT?
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1424752547055783936
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1417494211574878222
C.3
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1399165255259987974
“There Are Many Others”: 215 Bodies Found at Canadian Residential School for Indigenous Children
https://www.instagram.com/p/CPfiF3VAtC5/?hl=en
C.4
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1424707202292625413
NDP MPs call for investigation into crimes against Indigenous children at residential schools
A.1 bis
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1411518287469367298
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1413305389236510720
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1411638585497894912
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1401916747293155335
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1393950108111282176
Climate change requires system change
Greta Thunberg: World must ‘tear up’ old contracts, build new systems to save climate
Jeremy Corbyn on Twitter: "We need a global green deal for people and planet 🌍 System change not climate change. https://t.co/FUoORMuMhI"
Jeremy Corbyn on Twitter: "We need radical policies to address the climate emergency. I am looking forward to going to Glasgow as part of a massive movement for a #GreenNewDeal that puts people and planet first. #COP26 https://t.co/RSuQtSIJXH"
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1403091684445634017
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1416047834638561288
Young Peoples Action Coalition stands against line 3
Stop Line 3! (@stopline3pipeline) • Instagram photos and videos
Young people’s climate anxiety revealed in landmark survey.
https://www.instagram.com/p/CUC9NwmJxOt/?utm_medium=share_sheet
C.5
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1425122905524944899
‘No surprise but a stark warning’: How scientists around world reacted to IPCC’s landmark climate report
New climate report wasn’t surprising to Indigenous peoples, who see change up close
D.1
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/142436141582618624
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1425986758550900742
D.1 bis
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1424361415826186247
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1424652206595248129
Climate change widespread, rapid, and intensifying
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1424743223629549582
Red code
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1424762024660066307
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1424677072732049409
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1424692160901701640
D.2
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1424755987047669764
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1424933566748626946
D.3
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1420826776922595329
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1415938582808862720
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1419378605700698117
E.1
https://twitter.com/jeremycorbyn/status/1420771353846820867
https://twitter.com/i/web/status/1422099883348144131

Tweets

The United Nations is NOT our friend and ANY report they put out on climate change is FAKERY.

Everyone knows the communists just want to use this climate buffoonery as a tool to reshape our economy and have us suck on governments ever shrinking teets!

#UnitedNationsCommunists

Por fin lo dicen abiertamente: pretenden arruinar a nuestras naciones con la excusa de “salvar el planeta”.

Los mismos que se arrodillan ante China, que seguirá contaminando y pagando esbirros en gobiernos, en organismos supranacionales y en medios de comunicación.